

**The Birmingham News**

EVENING AND SUNDAY

NEWS DEPARTMENT  
VINCENT TOWNSEND, MANAGING EDITOR

BIRMINGHAM 2, ALA.

March 4th, 1958

Dear Sir:

This is a photostat of the autopsy report on Phyllis Dean Carver made by Dr. L.C. Posey, a pathologist.

He died within a few days of this autopsy, and the fact that he had made such a report was kept secret for many years.

It was not until 1957 that I was able to obtain a copy. Frankly, I turned it over to a pathologist here. He made a cursory examination of it and compared it with the report of State Toxicologist C.D. Brooks and told me there were several areas of variance. The chief one, he said, dealt with the finding of male sperm.

You have already read Brooks' testimony, I believe.

What we need here--at the earliest possible moment--is a comparison of the report made by Dr. Posey and the one made by Brooks, and also of the report made by Dr. Posey and Brooks testimony.

Since we hope to have everything worked out here on February 12 towards a pardon for Ellis Fewell, it is vital that we obtain the report at the first possible moment.

Best regards,

*Clancy Lake*

Clancy Lake  
The Birmingham News

REPORT OF AUTOPSY

---

Name:	Phyllis Carver	Autopsy Number:	A-49-15
Age:	Nine years	Date of Death	
Sex:	Female	Date of Autopsy:	4-12-49 at 1:15 P.M.
Race:	White	Requested by:	Coroner T. J. McCollum

GROSS ANATOMICAL DIAGNOSES:

1. Wounds, multiple, extreme, lacerating and penetrating, neck and thorax (stab wounds of heart, laceration of left common carotid artery and trachea, stab wounds of left lung).
2. Contusion of right face and of neck.
3. Dilatation, anal sphincter.

MICROSCOPIC DIAGNOSIS:

No additions can be made to the anatomical diagnoses as listed.

External Examination:

The body is that of a nine-year-old white female measuring 138 cm. in length. It is well developed and well nourished. Rigor mortis is complete, except for the neck which is easily moved (no fractures, however). Numerous blood stains are present about the head, face, neck, anterior chest, and left arm - and to these are stuck numerous fragments of grass. The right pupil measures 0.7 mm., the left 6 mm.; they are round and equal. A small amount of clotted blood is present in the right nostril, but its origin is external.

There are numerous lacerations and contusions over the body. These are listed below:

1. On the right occiput is a jagged T-shaped laceration measuring 2 x 15 cm. (no bony defect).
2. On the left occiput is a horizontally situated scalp laceration 2.5 cm. long (no bony defect).
3. Over the left scapula, and penetrating to the bone, are two almost parallel, vertically situated smooth-edged lacerations, each 2 cm. in length.
4. On the dorsum of the right hand, over the second metacarpal bone, is a 2.5-cm. superficial laceration with no evidence of contusion or bleeding.
5. Two small round abrasions are present over the bridge of the nose.
6. There is a diffuse contusion of the right malar prominence, cheek, and right upper lip, with a mottled blue color of the skin. The under surface of the affected lip has a ragged laceration 1 cm. in length, with contusions of the surrounding mucous membrane. There is a linear depressed and excoriated lesion extending diagonally from the medial side of the right supra-orbital ridge, through the middle of the right infra-orbital prominence, into the lateral right cheek area.
7. There is a somewhat irregularly shaped, smooth-edged, gaping laceration of the anterior neck measuring 10 cm. in length. It extends from a point 3 cm. below the angle of the left jaw to a point 3 cm. to the right of the midline. The deep fascia of the neck is entered, the left common carotid artery severed, and the trachea severed in two places - above and below the cricoid cartilage.
8. The skin overlying the suprasternal notch and supraclavicular fossae is a mottled blue and pink, due to the presence of small extravasations of blood into the underlying superficial corium.



External Examination: (continued)

9. The anterior and lateral surface of the left chest is diffusely swollen and fine crepitation is noted in the soft tissues on palpation.

10. There is a left parasternal irregularly shaped, smooth-edged penetrating laceration measuring 9 cm. in length. The costochondral cartilage is severed once through the left first rib, three times through the second rib, and once through the third rib.

Lateral and slightly inferior to the above are two penetrating lacerations, the uppermost measuring 3.5 cm., and the lowermost 2 cm. The costochondral cartilage of the left 4th rib is partially severed from above and below by these two lacerations.

(See description of heart and lungs for depth of the above-described lacerations.)

11. There is a deep, 3.5-cm. laceration over the left anterior axillary fold, a 1-cm. superficial laceration high in the axilla, and a 1.5-cm. superficial laceration in the midportion of the left lateral chest wall.

12. There is a laceration of the right knee 1.2 cm. in length, and a small contusion of the left knee measuring 2 cm. in diameter (anteromedial aspect).

13. The rectum is dilated to a size 2.5 x 2 cm, and displays a small quantity of feces externally. There is questionably a small longitudinally situated laceration of the mucocutaneous junction posteriorly. No evidence of hemorrhage or contusion is noted.

14. There are depressed linear excoriations passing longitudinally along the upper back and cross-wise over the left buttock and left calf posteriorly.

External genitalia exhibit no pubic hair. The hymen is semilunar in shape and is intact.

Peritoneal Cavity:

The organs lie properly situated. The diaphragm lies at the level of the 3rd interspace on the right and the 4th interspace on the left. The lower margin is visible only in the epigastrium. No adhesions are present. The appendix is present and natural. Numerous mesenteric lymph nodes are palpable.



Pleural Cavities:

The right is negative.

On the left the lateral surfaces of the left upper and lower lobes are bound to the chest wall by fairly firm adhesions and the interlobar fissure is partially obliterated by adhesions. A small quantity of clotted blood is present in the left pleural cavity.

Pericardium:

There are three smooth-edged lacerations into the anterior surface of the pericardium: one overlying the pulmonary artery, one overlying the apex of the heart, and one overlying the midportion of the left ventricle. Corresponding penetrating wounds are found in the heart and pulmonary artery. The pericardial sac contains about 25 cc. of fluid blood (this clots on exposure).

Heart:

Weights 140 gm. Over the upper anterior surface of the right ventricle and in a similar location on the left are two similar yellowish, irregular scars limited to the epicardium. A fatty adhesion deposit is noted over the anterior portion of the apex. To the right of the interventricular septum, near the apex, is penetrating wound (0.5 cm.) which, when probed, extends 4.5 cm. to the left and posteriorly through the cavity of the left ventricle and into the posterior ventricular wall to the epicardial surface where a small wound (0.2 cm.) is noted with surrounding ecchymosis. In the midportion anteriorly, and just to the left of the interventricular septum, is a second penetrating wound (0.7 cm.) which passes 3.5 cm. upward towards the base, penetrates the ventricular cavity, and then re-enters the left ventricular wall at the atrioventricular junction, causing a small ecchymosis into the epicardium at this latter point.

The valves appear natural, as does the endocardium.

On the anterior surface of the pulmonary artery is a third laceration (0.5 cm.).

The point of skin entrance for each of these lacerations is separate, and corresponds in location to the penetrating wounds described under item #10. The deepest penetrating wound of the heart measures 6.5 cm. from skin through the posterior myocardial wall.

Lungs:

Weigh 120 gm. each.

The right lung is well expanded and shows a pale-pink pleural surface and normal cut surface.

The left lung displays the adhesions described. Near its upper antero-medial margin are three shallow lacerations of the lung measuring 0.5, 1.2, and 1.6 cm. in length respectively. These lacerations were made through the large gaping uppermost chest wound. There is also a 0.6-cm. laceration of the lateral surface of the left upper lobe, which underlies the wide penetrating laceration of the chest, described under item #11. The left bronchioles are partially filled with clotted blood.

The deepest penetrating wound of the lung measured approximately 45.5 cm. in depth.

Thymus:

Weighs 20 gm. It shows extravasation of blood into its superior border.

Liver:

Weighs 800 gm., is relatively firm, and of a brownish-red color.

The gallbladder contains dark-green bile.

Spleen:

Weighs 80 gm. and appears natural on section.

Pancreas:

Weighs 40 gm. and appears natural on multiple sections. A number of peripancreatic lymph nodes appear as opaque bright-yellow on section.

Gastro-intestinal Tract:

The rectum is as described. The stomach is partially distended with a mass of partially digested food - corn kernels, string beans, macerated vegetable leaves. The duodenum contains light yellow fluid. Soft feces are present in the lower sigmoid colon and in the rectum. No mucoid material is evident. The mesentery of the small intestine encloses numerous bean-sized lymph nodes which, on section, are semitranslucent and bright-yellow.



Adrenal Glands:

Weigh together 20 gm. They appear natural on section.

Kidneys:

Weigh together 180 gm. The capsule strips with ease, revealing a smooth surface. The corticomedullary markings appear natural, as do the pelves and ureters.

Pelvis:

The cul-de-sac contains about 2 cc. of clear yellowish fluid. The urinary bladder is partially distended with clear yellow urine. The internal genitalia appear natural and infantile.

Head:

No internal examination was made.

## POSTMORTEM LABORATORY STUDIES

Serum sugar 58 mg.%

Blood urea nitrogen 8 mg.%

(When centrifuged, 1.5 ml. of serum and 8.5 ml. of cells are obtained. There is marked hemolysis.)

Urine alcohol (Bogan) Negative

Urinalysis:

Specific gravity	1.027
Albumin	Trace
Microscopic:	Rare pus cell



MICROSCOPIC EXAMINATION:Thymus:

The sections of the thymus are not remarkable. There is some shrinkage and beginning autolytic change.

Heart:

The sections show some broadening of the intermuscular septa in sections of the right ventricle. There is slight engorgement of blood vessels. In the posterior aspect of the heart is shown one of the lacerations described in the gross. The epicardium is cut through and there is extravasation of blood into it.

Lung:

The sections show the left lung. From the areas of trauma described in the gross there is extensive extravasation of blood into air sacs of the two fragments mentioned. Blood vessels are dilated and engorged. There is beginning autolytic desquamation of the bronchial mucous membrane.

Liver:

Sections of the liver show postdigestive vacuolation and pallor of the liver cells, but there are no specific lesions present.

Spleen:

The sections of the spleen show emptying of the sinusoids and the pulp of almost all of the red blood cells usually seen. There are some autolytic changes in marginal portions of the spleen, but no specific lesions are present.

Pancreas:

The section shows autolytic change. No specific lesion is seen.

Peripancreatic Lymph Nodes:

The section shows marked postmortem autolysis.

Stomach:

The sections of the fundal portions of the stomach show no significant changes.

Small Intestine:

There is considerable autolytic change of the mucous membrane.

Mesenteric Lymph Nodes:

The section shows considerable autolysis of the medullary portion of the node.

Adrenal Gland:

No specific changes are present, though at one pole there is some autolysis.

Kidney:

The section is not remarkable.

Ovary:

The section is not remarkable.

Anus:

The section of the anal canal showing the reddish area described in the gross reveals a small patch of dilated mucosal hemorrhoidal vessels that are engorged with blood. There is no evidence of extravasation of blood. There are no tears noted in the surface of the mucous membrane. There is some autolytic change in the glandular epithelium.

Smears from Anal Mucous Membrane:

A number of smears from the mucous membrane of the anal canal show mucus and numbers of bacteria of various sorts, but no spermatids can be recognized in any of the material.

*L. C. Posey*  
L. C. Posey, M.D.

ES

REPORT OF AUTOPSY

Name:	Phyllis Carver	Autopsy Number:	A-49-15
Age:	Nine years	Date of Death	
Sex:	Female	Date of Autopsy:	4-12-49 at 1:15 P.M.
Race:	White	Requested by:	Coroner T. J. McCollum

GROSS ANATOMICAL DIAGNOSES:

1. Wounds, multiple, extreme, lacerating and penetrating, neck and thorax (stab wounds of heart, laceration of left common carotid artery and trachea, stab wounds of left lung).
2. Contusion of right face and of neck.
3. Dilatation, anal sphincter.

MICROSCOPIC DIAGNOSIS:

No additions can be made to the anatomical diagnoses as listed.



External Examination:

The body is that of a nine-year-old white female measuring 138 cm. in length. It is well developed and well nourished. Rigor mortis is complete, except for the neck which is easily moved (no fractures, however). Numerous blood stains are present about the head, face, neck, anterior chest, and left arm - and to these are stuck numerous fragments of grass. The right pupil measures 0.7 mm., the left 6 mm.; they are round and equal. A small amount of clotted blood is present in the right nostril, but its origin is external.

There are numerous lacerations and contusions over the body. These are listed below:

1. On the right occiput is a jagged T-shaped laceration measuring 8 x 15 cm. (no bony defect).
2. On the left occiput is a horizontally situated scalp laceration 2.5 cm. long (no bony defect).
3. Over the left scapula, and penetrating to the bone, are two almost parallel, vertically situated smooth-edged lacerations, each 2 cm. in length.
4. On the dorsum of the right hand, over the second metacarpal bone, is a 2.5-cm. superficial laceration with no evidence of contusion or bleeding.
5. Two small round abrasions are present over the bridge of the nose.
6. There is a diffuse contusion of the right malar prominence, cheek, and right upper lip, with a mottled blue color of the skin. The under surface of the affected lip has a ragged laceration 1 cm. in length, with contusions of the surrounding mucous membrane. There is a linear depressed and excoriated lesion extending diagonally from the medial side of the right supra-orbital ridge, through the middle of the right infra-orbital prominence, into the lateral right cheek area.
7. There is a somewhat irregularly shaped, smooth-edged, gaping laceration of the anterior neck measuring 10 cm. in length. It extends from a point 3 cm. below the angle of the left jaw to a point 3 cm. to the right of the midline. The deep fascia of the neck is entered, the left common carotid artery severed, and the trachea severed in two places - above and below the cricoid cartilage.
8. The skin overlying the suprasternal notch and supraclavicular fossae is a mottled blue and pink, due to the presence of small extravasations of blood into the underlying superficial corium.



External Examination: (continued)

9. The anterior and lateral surface of the left chest is diffusely swollen and fine crepitation is noted in the soft tissues on palpation.

10. There is a left parasternal irregularly shaped, smooth-edged penetrating laceration measuring 9 cm. in length. The costochondral cartilage is severed once through the left first rib, three times through the second rib, and once through the third rib.

Lateral and slightly inferior to the above are two penetrating lacerations, the uppermost measuring 3.5 cm., and the lowermost 2 cm. The costochondral cartilage of the left 4th rib is partially severed from above and below by these two lacerations.

(See description of heart and lungs for depth of the above-described lacerations.)

11. There is a deep, 3.5-cm. laceration over the left anterior axillary fold, a 1-cm. superficial laceration high in the axilla, and a 1.5-cm. superficial laceration in the midportion of the left lateral chest wall.

12. There is a laceration of the right knee 1.2 cm. in length, and a small contusion of the left knee measuring 2 cm. in diameter (anteromedial aspect).

13. The rectum is dilated to a size 2.5 x 2 cm, and displays a small quantity of feces externally. There is questionably a small longitudinally situated laceration of the mucocutaneous junction posteriorly. No evidence of hemorrhage or contusion is noted.

14. There are depressed linear excoriations passing longitudinally along the upper back and cross-wise over the left buttock and left calf posteriorly.

External genitalia exhibit no pubic hair. The hymen is semilunar in shape and is intact.

Peritoneal Cavity:

The organs lie properly situated. The diaphragm lies at the level of the 3rd interspace on the right and the 4th interspace on the left. The lower margin is visible only in the epigastrium. No adhesions are present. The appendix is present and natural. Numerous mesenteric lymph nodes are palpable.



Pleural Cavities:

The right is negative.

On the left the lateral surfaces of the left upper and lower lobes are bound to the chest wall by fairly firm adhesions and the interlobar fissure is partially obliterated by adhesions. A small quantity of clotted blood is present in the left pleural cavity.

Pericardium:

There are three smooth-edged lacerations into the anterior surface of the pericardium: one overlying the pulmonary artery, one overlying the apex of the heart, and one overlying the midportion of the left ventricle. Corresponding penetrating wounds are found in the heart and pulmonary artery. The pericardial sac contains about 25 cc. of fluid blood (this clots on exposure).

Heart:

Weights 140 gm. Over the upper anterior surface of the right ventricle and in a similar location on the left are two similar yellowish, irregular scars limited to the epicardium. A fatty adhesion deposit is noted over the anterior portion of the apex. To the right of the interventricular septum, near the apex, is penetrating wound (0.5 cm.) which, when probed, extends 4.5 cm. to the left and posteriorly through the cavity of the left ventricle and into the posterior ventricular wall to the epicardial surface where a small wound (0.2 cm.) is noted with surrounding ecchymosis. In the midportion anteriorly, and just to the left of the interventricular septum, is a second penetrating wound (0.7 cm.) which passes 3.5 cm. upward towards the base, penetrates the ventricular cavity, and then re-enters the left ventricular wall at the atrioventricular junction, causing a small ecchymosis into the epicardium at this latter point.

The valves appear natural, as does the endocardium.

On the anterior surface of the pulmonary artery is a third laceration (0.5 cm.).

The point of skin entrance for each of these lacerations is separate, and corresponds in location to the penetrating wounds described under item #10. The deepest penetrating wound of the heart measures 6.5 cm. from skin through the posterior myocardial wall.



Lungs:

Weight 120 gm. each.

The right lung is well expanded and shows a pale-pink pleural surface and normal cut surface.

The left lung displays the adhesions described. Near its upper antero-medial margin are three shallow lacerations of the lung measuring 0.5, 1.2, and 1.6 cm. in length respectively. These lacerations were made through the large gaping uppermost chest wound. There is also a 0.6-cm. laceration of the lateral surface of the left upper lobe, which underlies the wide penetrating laceration of the chest, described under item #11. The left bronchioles are partially filled with clotted blood.

The deepest penetrating wound of the lung measured approximately 45.5 cm. in depth.

Thymus:

Weights 20 gm. It shows extravasation of blood into its superior border.

Liver:

Weight 800 gm., is relatively firm, and of a brownish-red color.

The gallbladder contains dark-green bile.

Spleen:

Weight 80 gm. and appears natural on section.

Pancreas:

Weight 40 gm. and appears natural on multiple sections. A number of peripancreatic lymph nodes appear as opaque bright-yellow on section.

Gastro-intestinal Tract:

The rectum is as described. The stomach is partially distended with a mass of partially digested food - corn kernels, string beans, macerated vegetable leaves. The duodenum contains light yellow fluid. Soft feces are present in the lower sigmoid colon and in the rectum. No ameboid material is evident. The mesentery of the small intestine encloses numerous bean-sized lymph nodes which, on section, are semitranslucent and bright-yellow.



Adrenal Glands:

Weigh together 20 gm. They appear natural on section.

Kidneys:

Weigh together 180 gm. The capsule strips with ease, revealing a smooth surface. The corticomedullary markings appear natural, as do the pelvis and ureters.

Palvis:

The cul-de-sac contains about 2 cc. of clear yellowish fluid. The urinary bladder is partially distended with clear yellow urine. The internal genitalia appear natural and infantile.

Head:

No internal examination was made.

## POSTMORTEM LABORATORY STUDIES

Serum sugar 58 mg.%

Blood urea nitrogen 8 mg.%

(When centrifuged, 1.5 ml. of serum and 8.5 ml. of cells are obtained. There is marked hemolysis.)

Urine alcohol (Bogan) Negative

Urinalysis:

Specific gravity 1.027

Albumin Trace

Microscopic: Rare pus cell

MICROSCOPIC EXAMINATION:Thymus:

The sections of the thymus are not remarkable. There is some shrinkage and beginning autolytic change.

Heart:

The sections show some broadening of the intermuscular septa in sections of the right ventricle. There is slight engorgement of blood vessels. In the posterior aspect of the heart is shown one of the lacerations described in the gross. The epicardium is cut through and there is extravasation of blood into it.

Lung:

The sections show the left lung. From the areas of trauma described in the gross there is extensive extravasation of blood into air sacs of the two fragments mentioned. Blood vessels are dilated and engorged. There is beginning autolytic desquamation of the bronchial mucous membrane.

Liver:

Sections of the liver show postdigestive vacuolation and pallor of the liver cells, but there are no specific lesions present.

Spleen:

The sections of the spleen show emptying of the sinusoids and the pulp of almost all of the red blood cells usually seen. There are some autolytic changes in marginal portions of the spleen, but no specific lesions are present.

Pancreas:

The section shows autolytic change. No specific lesion is seen.

Peripancreatic Lymph Nodes:

The section shows marked postmortem autolysis.

Stomach:

The sections of the fundal portions of the stomach show no significant changes.



Small Intestine:

There is considerable autolytic change of the mucous membrane.

Mesenteric Lymph Nodes:

The section shows considerable autolysis of the medullary portion of the node.

Adrenal Gland:

No specific changes are present, though at one pole there is some autolysis.

Kidney:

The section is not remarkable.

Ovary:


The section is not remarkable.

Anus:

The section of the anal canal showing the reddish area described in the gross reveals a small patch of dilated mucosal hemorrhoidal vessels that are engorged with blood. There is no evidence of extravasation of blood. There are no tears noted in the surface of the mucous membrane. There is some autolytic change in the glandular epithelium.

Smears from Anal Mucous Membrane:

A number of smears from the mucous membrane of the anal canal show mucus and numbers of bacteria of various sorts, but no spermatids can be recognized in any of the material.

  
L. C. Posey, M.D.

REC

**The Birmingham News**

EVENING AND SUNDAY

NEWS DEPARTMENT  
VINCENT TOWNSEND, MANAGING EDITOR

BIRMINGHAM 2, ALA.

March 4th, 1958

Dear Sir:

These are various reports made by  
the toxicologist, C.D. Brooks, and which are  
to be compared with the report of Dr. Posey,  
the pathologist.

*Clancy Lake*  
Clancy Lake



DEPARTMENT OF FORENSIC SCIENCE  
and  
CRIMINAL INVESTIGATION  
Birmingham Division  
507 Public Health Building  
Birmingham 5, Alabama

May 7, 1949

Re: Our Case No. 7132  
Death - Jefferson County  
(Phyllis Dean Carver, wf, vic.)

MEMORANDUM TO: File

BY : C. D. Brooks

SUBJECT : Results of Laboratory Examinations

I have carefully examined the known hair specimens from the victim's head and have made comparisons of all loose hair removed from the clothing and the body.

The victim's hair exhibits, microscopically, a fairly wide range of color and size. So far, I have not found any of the loose hair which could not have been from her own body.

Microscopic examination of the fingernail scrapings has disclosed one very minute particle having all the characteristics of human epidermis, and several tiny particles of mucus associated with cells from the nasal mucosa. The one piece of skin consists entirely of the horny outer layer, containing no cellular nuclei. The pigment layer, is not present and therefore no opinion can be given as to the race of origin. There is nothing to show that this skin is from other than the victim's own body. The removal of this thin outer layer of skin would not cause pain, probably would escape notice.

The piece of wrapping paper was examined for fingerprints but none suitable for identification were disclosed.

The spears were stained and examined microscopically. Numerous portions of spermatozoa were found and a few heads with broke or eroded tails. Under the conditions of moistness and bacterial decomposition extant in this instance, it is my conclusion that human semen was injected into the rectum of this victim.

All fibers found on the victim's hands and on the clothing were examined and found to be either miscellaneous vegetable fibers other than textiles, or similar to the garments of the victim.

STATE OF ALABAMA )  
JEFFERSON COUNTY )

C. D. Brooks

This is to certify that the above is a true and exact copy of the original document on file in the Solicitor's office, Jefferson County, Bessemer, Alabama.

*Louise G. Ashley*

Page 3 - Memo. to File, Case No. 7132, 5/2/49.

The hands were clenched and held near the face. A few hairs and fibers were removed from the hands for laboratory examination.

There were three ragged lacerations of the scalp on the rear of the head. These probably were inflicted very near the time of death or afterward because there was no discernible swelling of the skull beneath these. These were blunt instrument wounds, not knife wounds.

Examination of the chest wound indicated the fatal instrument (assuming all the cuts were made with one instrument) was a sharp knife which probably was about 5/8" wide at one inch from the end.

A specimen of the feces just inside the rectum was preserved for possible comparison with stains on suspect's clothing. Dr. Posey opened the stomach and duodenum and found the stomach full of partially digested food and that it had only just before death begun to empty into the intestine. The stomach contents were removed for laboratory examination.

C. D. Trucks

STATE OF ALABAMA

JEFFERSON COUNTY

This is to certify that the above is a true and correct copy of the original document on file in the Solicitor's office, Jefferson County, Alabama.

Louise G. Ashley



STATE OF ALABAMA  
DEPARTMENT OF TOXICOLOGY  
and  
CRIMINAL INVESTIGATION  
Birmingham Division  
507 Public Health Building  
Birmingham 5, Alabama

May 4, 1949

Re: Our Case No. 7132  
Death - Jefferson County  
(Phyllis Dean Garvey, Wf, dec.)

MEMORANDUM TO: File

BY : C. D. Brooks

SUBJECT : Examination of clothing of victim.

A few fibers and hairs were found on the raincoat and removed for comparison.

The raincoat, blouse and slip have been cut open by the positions of the knife wounds on the body. Examination of these cuts indicates a knife blade  $5/8$ " wide or slightly less was used.

The step-ins were relatively very clean and were in place on the body. Unfortunately, due to the fact that someone carelessly placed the blood-soaked quilt on the cloth at the hospital amid the confusion during the autopsy, the step-ins are now thoroughly bloodstained.

Examination of the suspicious stains near the rear end of the step-ins has not produced decisive results but this portion will be re-tested for semen.

C. D. Brooks

STATE OF ALABAMA  
JEFFERSON COUNTY

This is to certify that the above is a true and exact copy of the original document on file in the Solicitor's office, Jefferson County, Bessemer, Alabama.

Louise J. Ashley

DEPARTMENT OF TOXICOLOGY  
and  
CRIMINAL INVESTIGATION  
Birmingham Division  
507 Public Health Building  
Birmingham 5, Alabama

May 2, 1949

Re: Our Case No. 7112  
Death - Jefferson County  
(Phyllis Dean Carter, wf, vic.)

Memorandum to: File

By : C. D. Brooks

Subject : Examination of scene and autopsy.

I arrived at the scene about 10:30 A.M., 4/11/49, and met Coroner McCollum and several Birmingham Division deputies and other persons. The immediate vicinity of the body had been roped off.

At the end of the curving "road" there were tire tracks made by slightly spinning automobile tires. There were no clear marks but the 6 stripes in one track indicated a rib tread, "B" type, without corrugations or waves in the ribs (left rear wheel).

Near these tracks were two areas: (1 - see enclosed sketch) on the bare ground, and (2) nearby on the grass and leaves, where dried or semi-dried bloodstains were. They would have been on the right side and right rear of an automobile parked as was the car which made the spinning wheel-marks.

Approximately twenty-two feet uphill from these bloodstains was (3) another stained area roughly 6" in diameter. Approximately 40 feet further uphill was the (4) body. It lay on its left side against some small brush or saplings about 6 feet to the right of the clearing which ran uphill from the spots (1) and (2). Said clearing was just wide enough to pass an automobile, was clearly marked out not a "road", ended at about the position of the body, which point was nearer the county road than the point where the tire tracks were. Grass and leaves covered most of the ground. Considerable debris, glass, cans, paper, etc., were scattered around.

Coroner McCollum pointed out to me several items which he said he had gathered from the vicinity of the spots (1) and (2). These were: one black shoe girl's left "ballerina" slipper - 9" long, 3-1/8" across the sole; two nickels - one "Monticello", one "Buffalo"; two green buttons; one black plastic button 1/8" thick and 7/8" in diameter with metal eyelet. In the vicinity of spot No. 2 was a piece of wrapping paper approximately 12" x 18" with a considerable amount of fresh, smeared-on, bloodstains.

(12) The body was wrapped in a quilt and carried to the Jefferson-Hill Hospital in Coroner McCollum's car. Here Mr. McCollum was advised, after some delay, that Dr. McManus could not perform the autopsy.



Page 2 - Memo. to File, Case No. 7132, 5/2/49.

Therefore, Dr. L. C. Posey was contacted and Mr. McCollum took the body to the T.C.I. Hospital. The autopsy was conducted by Dr. Posey and Dr. Alford in the presence of Coroner McCollum, Solicitor's Investigator Ragsdale, Mr. James N. Smith and this investigator. A considerable number of internes and nurses came in at odd times for a short view of the body.

There the body was examined and the clothing removed by Mr. McCollum and myself. Several loose fibers and hairs were found on various parts of the clothing and body. They were removed for further study. Specimens of the child's hair was also taken. The fingernails were short and soft, closely clinging to the fingers, but such material as was lodged under the nails was removed for further examination.

Examination of the body disclosed a multiple stroke laceration in the neck starting about an inch below the left ear and ending somewhat lower on the right front of the neck. The trachea (windpipe) was severed in two places, approximately 1/2 inch apart. The left carotid artery and other large blood vessels were severed.

There were nine lacerations on the chest, left side and back. In the left side of the chest (roughly 6" below the shoulder) there were several shallow, approximately 3/4 inch long lacerations. Spaced irregularly under the left arm and around toward the front were other lacerations of various sizes. The largest was approximately 6" long and extended into the chest cavity. A hole of about 2 inches long and nearly an inch wide exposed the internal organs etc. This largest chest laceration was also made with more than one stroke. The point of the knife had punctured the lung and penetrated the heart wall in several places. In three places the ribs had been completely and cleanly severed and in two places cut into from the top side. All these cuts were in the soft sternum portions.

There were some bruises on the front of her neck above and below the laceration. The upper lip on the right side was swollen and dark, there was a small laceration on the underside of the lip (cut on the teeth by the blow which caused the bruise and swelling). This injury had been inflicted some time before the principal fatal wounds. There were numerous vertical scratches on the back, (indicating she had been dragged by her feet), and we were undecided then whether these were post-mortem or ante-mortem. It is probable they were made very close to the time of death, a very few minutes either way. Dr. Posey and Dr. Alford may have re-examined these and have a more definite opinion.

The anus was dilated and discolored with feces. There was no injury to the vulva. The hymen was intact and no bruises were found. There was no definite sign of ante-mortem bruises about the anus.

Smears were made from the mucus-like material outside and inside the anus.

STATE OF ALABAMA  
DEPARTMENT OF TOXICOLOGY  
and  
CRIMINAL INVESTIGATION  
Birmingham Division  
507 Public Health Building  
Birmingham 5, Alabama

May 10, 1949

Hon. Howard Sullinger  
Circuit Solicitor  
Bessemer, Alabama

Re: Our Case No. 7132  
Homicide - Jefferson County  
Phyllis Dean Carver, wf, vic.)

Dear Mr. Sullinger:

I am attaching herewith copies of several memorandum reports on my examinations of the scene and of evidence in this investigation. Each result in these reports has been reported by telephone or in person to one or more of the principal investigators as soon as the tests were made. This is the first written report on these examinations.

As the request of Captain Norrell I have tried to avoid technical terms which might be confusing to the investigating officers. Copies of this report are being furnished the investigating officers in Bessemer, Ensley and Birmingham.

I trust that the interpretations of the evidence are sufficient for the immediate needs of the investigators. If they need other interpretations, or facts noted but not described herein, I will be glad to cooperate with them.

I am also enclosing three photographs. Due to mechanical difficulties with the camera, several of those taken in the autopsy room were unsatisfactory. These do illustrate, however, the essential facts needed for this investigation.

I have omitted reference to the Johnny Davis matter. In view of the way that case turned out, I have filed it as a separate offense.

Trusting this information will be of value to you, I am,

Yours very truly,

C. J. REMLING  
STATE TOXICOLOGIST  
By: C. D. Brooks  
Associate Toxicologist

CDB:jlb



STATE OF ALABAMA  
DEPARTMENT OF TOXICOLOGY  
and  
CRIMINAL INVESTIGATION  
Birmingham Division  
507 Public Health Building  
Birmingham 5, Alabama

April 15, 1949

Re: Our Case No. 7112  
Homicide - Jefferson County  
(Phyllis Dean Carver, wf, vic.)

MEMORANDUM TO: File

BY : C. D. Brooks

SUBJECT : Examination of submitted evidence.

Tuesday, April 12th, Sheriff W. A. Mayner of Blount County telephoned me and stated that a piece of bloodstained newspaper had been found on the streets of Opelika. The paper was part of an April 7th issue of the Birmingham Post.

At my suggestion he sent it to us for examination.

Serological tests showed that the blood was not of human origin.

C. D. Brooks

STATE OF ALABAMA  
JEFFERSON COUNTY

This is to certify that the above is a true and exact copy of the original document on file in the Solicitor's office, Jefferson County, Beasaver, Alabama.

Louise L. Ashley

STATE OF ALABAMA  
DEPARTMENT OF PATHOLOGY  
and  
CRIMINAL INVESTIGATION  
Birmingham Division  
507 Public Health Building  
Birmingham 5, Alabama

May 10, 1949

Re: Our Case No. 7132  
Homicide - Jefferson County  
(Phyllis Dean Carver, wf, vic.)

MEMORANDUM TO: File

BY : C. D. Brooks

SUBJECT : Laboratory examination of stomach contents.

Examination of these stomach contents has shown several pieces of snap beans, whole and parts of corn kernels, pieces of partially digested raw cabbage, relatively large pieces of orange (or other citrus) pulp, the tough outer part, and some small pieces of nuts, probably "washed" peanuts. These latter may be cashew nuts or possibly almonds.

The contents consisted of a dark mass of almost completely digested material containing the above-mentioned items, some of which showed very little digestion.

Sketchy information received by Mr. Hagsdale and Mr. McCollum principally from the victim's younger sister (and relayed to me 4/13/49) indicated the victim ate a midday meal including snap beans, slaw, corn-on-the-cob, and orange about 1 p.m. and just before 3:45 p.m. ate some more of the same fare.

Based upon that information and some comments by Dr. Pooch, it is my judgment that death occurred probably between 6 and 7 p.m. Also, the victim consumed some peanuts or candy containing peanuts after she left home - but I cannot say definitely whether before or after seeing the show.

STATE OF ALABAMA  
JEFFERSON COUNTY

C. D. Brooks

This is to certify that the above is a true and exact copy of the original document on file in the Solicitor's office, Jefferson County, Bessemer, Alabama.

Louise A. Ashley

150



STATE OF ALABAMA  
DEPARTMENT OF TOXICOLOGY  
and  
CRIMINAL INVESTIGATION  
Birmingham Division  
507 Public Health Building  
Birmingham 5, Alabama

May 7, 1949

Re: Our Case No. 7132  
Death - Jefferson County  
(Phyllis Dean Carver, wf, vic.)

MEMORANDUM TO: File

BY : C. D. Brooks

SUBJECT : Results of Laboratory Examinations

I have carefully examined the known hair specimens from the victim's head and have made comparisons of all loose hair removed from the clothing and the body.

The victim's hair exhibits, microscopically, a fairly wide range of color and size. So far, I have not found any of the loose hair which could not have been from her own body.

Microscopic examination of the fingernail scrap has disclosed one very minute particle having all the characteristics of human epidermis, and several tiny particles of mucus associated with cells from the nasal mucosa. The one piece of skin consists entirely of the horny outer layer, containing no cellular nuclei. The pigment layer, is not present and therefore no opinion can be given as to the race of origin. There is nothing to show that this skin is from other than the victim's own body. The removal of this thin outer layer of skin would not cause pain, probably would escape notice.

The piece of wrapping paper was examined for fingerprints but none suitable for identification were disclosed.

The smears were stained and examined microscopically. Numerous portions of spermatozoa were found and a few heads with broke or eroded tails. Under the conditions of moistness and bacterial decomposition extant in this instance, it is my conclusion that human semen was injected into the rectum of this victim.

All fibers found on the victim's hands and on the clothing were examined and found to be either miscellaneous vegetable fibers other than textiles, or similar to the garments of the victim.

STATE OF ALABAMA )  
JEFFERSON COUNTY )

C. D. Brooks

This is to certify that the above is a true and exact copy of the original document on file in the Solicitor's office, Jefferson County, Bessemer, Alabama.

*Louise G. Ashley*

Page 3 - Memo. to File, Case No. 7132, 5/2/49.

The hands were clinched and held near the face. A few hairs and fibers were removed from the hands for laboratory examination.

There were three ragged lacerations of the scalp on the rear of the head. These probably were inflicted very near the time of death or afterward because there was no discernible swelling of the skull beneath these. These were blunt instrument wounds, not knife wounds.

Examination of the chest wound indicated the fatal instrument (assuming all the cuts were made with one instrument) was a sharp knife which probably was about 5/8" wide at one inch from the end.

A specimen of the feces just inside the rectum was preserved for possible comparison with stains on suspect's clothing. Dr. Posey opened the stomach and duodenum and found the stomach full of partially digested food and that it had only just before death begun to empty into the intestines. The stomach contents were preserved for laboratory examination.

C. D. Brooks

STATE OF ALABAMA

JEFFERSON COUNTY

This is to certify that the above is a true and correct copy of the original document on file in the Solicitor's office, Jefferson County, Bessemer, Alabama.

Louise G. Ashley



STATE OF ALABAMA  
DEPARTMENT OF TOXICOLOGY  
and  
CRIMINAL INVESTIGATION  
Birmingham Division  
507 Public Health Building  
Birmingham 5, Alabama

May 4, 1949

Re: Our Case No. 7132  
Death - Jefferson County  
(Phyllis Dean Carver, wf, dec.)

MEMORANDUM TO: File

BY : C. D. Brooks

SUBJECT : Examination of clothing of victim.

A few fibers and hairs were found on the trousers removed for comparison.

The raincoat, pants and slip have been cut at the positions of the knife wounds on the body. Examination of these cuts indicates a knife blade 5/8" wide or slightly less than 1" wide.

The step-ins were relatively very clean and were placed on the body. Unfortunately, due to the fact that someone carelessly placed the bloodsoaked pants on the clothing at the hospital amid the confusion during the autopsy, the step-ins are now thoroughly bloodstained.

Examination of the suspicious stain near the rear top of the step-ins has not produced decisive results but this portion will be re-tested for semen.

C. D. Brooks

STATE OF ALABAMA }  
JEFFERSON COUNTY }

This is to certify that the above is a true and exact copy of the original document on file in the Solicitor's Office, Jefferson County, Bessemer, Alabama.

Louise L. Ashley

DEPARTMENT OF TOXICOLOGY  
and  
CRIMINAL INVESTIGATION  
Birmingham Division  
507 Public Health Building  
Birmingham 5, Alabama

May 2, 1949

Re: Our Case No. 7132  
Death - Jefferson County  
(Phyllis Dean Carver, wf, vic.)

Memorandum to: File

By : C. D. Brooks

Subject : Examination of scene and autopsy.

I arrived at the scene about 10:30 A.M., 4/11/49, and met Coroner McCollum and several Bessemer Division deputies and other persons. The immediate vicinity of the body had been mowed off.

As the end of the curving "road" there were tire tracks made by slightly spinning automobile tires. There were no other marks but the 6 stripes in one track indicated a rib tread, 5" wide, without corrugations or waves in the ribs (left rear wheel).

Near these tracks were two areas; (1 - see enclosed sketch) on the bare ground, and (2) nearby on the grass and leaves, where dried or semi-dried bloodstains were. They would have been on the right side and right rear of an automobile parked as was the car which made the spinning wheel-marks.

Approximately twenty-two feet uphill from these bloodstains was (3) another stained area roughly 8" in diameter. Approximately 40 feet further uphill was the (4) body. It lay on its left side against some small brush or saplings about 6 feet to the right of the clearing which ran uphill from the spots (1) and (2). Said clearing was just wide enough to pass an automobile, was clearly marked but not a "road", ended at about the position of the body, which point was nearer the county road than the point where the tire tracks were. Grass and leaves covered most of the ground. Considerable debris, glass, cans, paper, etc., were scattered around.

Coroner McCollum pointed out to me several items which he said he had gathered from the vicinity of the spots (1) and (2). These were: one black suede girl's left "ballerina" slipper - 9" long, 3-1/8" across the sole; two nickels - one "Monticello", one "Buffalo"; two green buttons; one black plastic button 1/8" thick and 7/8" in diameter with metal eyelet. In the vicinity of spot No. 2 was a piece of wrapping paper approximately 12" x 18" with a considerable amount of fresh, smeared-on, bloodstains.

(13) The body was wrapped in a quilt and carried to the Jefferson-Hill Hospital in Coroner McCollum's car. Here Mr. McCollum was advised, after some delay, that Dr. McManus could not perform the autopsy.



Page 2 - Memo. to File, Case No. 7132, 5/2/49.

Therefore, Dr. L. C. Posey was contacted and Mr. McCollum took the body to the T.C.I. Hospital. The autopsy was conducted by Dr. Posey and Dr. Alford in the presence of Coroner McCollum, Solicitor's Investigator Ragsdale, Mr. James N. Smith and this investigator. A considerable number of internes and nurses came in at odd times for a short view of the body.

There the body was examined and the clothing removed by Mr. McCollum and myself. Several loose fibers and hairs were found on various parts of the clothing and body. They were removed for further study. Specimens of the child's hair was also taken. The fingernails were short and soft, closely clinging to the fingers, but such material as was lodged under the nails was removed for further examination.

Examination of the body disclosed a multiple stroke laceration in the neck starting about an inch below the left jaw and ending somewhat lower on the right front of the neck. The trachea (windpipe) was severed in two places, approximately 1/2 inch apart. The left carotid artery and other large blood vessels were severed.

There were nine lacerations on the chest, left side and back. In the left side of the back (roughly 6" below the shoulder) there were several shallow, approximately 3/4 inch long lacerations. Spaced irregularly under the left arm and around toward the front were other lacerations of various sizes. The largest was approximately 6" long and extended into the chest cavity. A hole of about 2 inches long and nearly an inch wide exposed the internal organs. This largest chest laceration was also made with more than one stroke. The point of the knife had punctured the lung and penetrated the heart wall in several places. In three places the ribs had been completely and cleanly severed and in two places cut into from the top side. All these cuts were in the soft sternum portions.

There were some bruises on the front of her neck above and below the laceration. The upper lip on the right side was swollen and dark, there was a small laceration on the underside of the lip (cut on the teeth by the blow which caused the bruise and swelling). This injury had been inflicted some time before the principal life wounds. There were numerous vertical scratches on the back, (indicating she had been dragged by her feet), and we were undecided then whether these were post-mortem or ante-mortem. It is probable they were made very close to the time of death, a very few minutes either way. Dr. Posey and Dr. Alford may have re-examined these and gave a more definite opinion.

The anus was dilated and discolored with feces. There was no injury to the vulva. The hymen was intact and no bruises were found. There was no definite sign of ante-mortem bruises about the anus.

Smears were made from the mucus-like material outside and inside the anus.

STATE OF ALABAMA  
DEPARTMENT OF TOXICOLOGY  
and  
CRIMINAL INVESTIGATION  
Birmingham Division  
507 Public Health Building  
Birmingham 5, Alabama

May 10, 1949

Hon. Howard Sullinger  
Circuit Solicitor  
Bessemer, Alabama

Re: Our Case No. 7132  
Homicide - Jefferson County  
Phyllis Dean Carver, wf, vic.)

Dear Mr. Sullinger:

I am attaching herewith copies of several memorandum reports on my examinations of the scene and of evidence in this investigation. Each result in these reports has been reported by telephone or in person to one or more of the principal investigators as soon as the tests were made. This is the first written report on these examinations.

As the request of Captain Norrell, I have tried to avoid technical terms which might be confusing to the investigating officers. Copies of this report are being furnished the investigating officers in Bessemer, Ensley and Birmingham.

I trust that the interpretations of the evidence are sufficient for the immediate needs of the investigators. If they need other interpretations, or facts noted but not described herein, I will be glad to cooperate with them.

I am also enclosing three photographs. Due to mechanical difficulties with the camera, several of those taken in the autopsy room were unsatisfactory. These do illustrate, however, the essential facts needed for this investigation.

I have omitted reference to the Johnny Davis matter. In view of the way that case turned out, I have filed it as a separate offense.

Trusting this information will be of value to you, I am,

Yours very truly,

C. J. REMLING  
STATE TOXICOLOGIST  
By: C. D. Brooks  
Associate Toxicologist

CDB:jlb



STATE OF ALABAMA  
DEPARTMENT OF TOXICOLOGY  
and  
CRIMINAL INVESTIGATION  
Birmingham Division  
507 Public Health Building  
Birmingham 5, Alabama

April 15, 1949

Re: Our Case No. 2  
Homicide - Jefferson County  
(Phyllis Dean Carver, wf, vic.)

MEMORANDUM TO: File

BY : C. D. Brooks

SUBJECT : Examination of submitted evidence.

Tuesday, April 12th, Sheriff W. A. Maynor of Blount County telephoned me and stated that a piece of bloodstained newspaper had been found on the streets of Oneonta. The paper was part of an April 7th issue of the Birmingham Post.

At my suggestion he sent it to us for examination.

Serological tests showed that the blood was not of human origin.

C. D. Brooks

STATE OF ALABAMA )  
JEFFERSON COUNTY )

This is to certify that the above is a true and exact copy of the original document on file in the Solicitor's office, Jefferson County, Beaumont, Alabama.

Louise L. Ashley

STATE OF ALABAMA  
DEPARTMENT OF FORENSIC SCIENCE  
and  
CRIMINAL INVESTIGATION  
Birmingham Division  
507 Public Health Building  
Birmingham 5, Alabama

May 10, 1949

Re: Our Case No. 7132  
Homicide - Jefferson County  
(Phyllis Dean Carver, vic.)

MEMORANDUM TO: File

BY : C. D. Brooks

SUBJECT : Laboratory examination of stomach contents.

Examination of these stomach contents has shown several pieces of snap beans, whole and parts of corn kernels, of partially digested raw cabbage, relatively large sizes of (or other citrus) pulp, the tough outer part, and some pieces of nuts, probably peanuts. These latter may be almonds or possibly almonds.

The contents consisted of a dark mass of almost completely digested material containing the above-mentioned items, none of which showed very little digestion.

Sketchy information received by Mr. Hagsdale and Mr. McCollum principally from the victim's younger sister (and related to me 4/13/49) indicated the victim ate a midday meal including snap beans, slaw, corn-on-the-cob, and orange about 1 p.m. and just before 3:45 p.m. ate some more of the same fare.

Based upon that information and some comments by Dr. Percy, it is my judgment that death occurred probably between 6 and 7 p.m. Also, the victim consumed some peanuts or candy containing peanuts after she left home - but I cannot say definitely whether before or after seeing the show.

STATE OF ALABAMA  
JEFFERSON COUNTY

C. D. Brooks

This is to certify that the above is a true and correct copy of the original document on file in the Solicitor's Office, Jefferson County, Bessemer, Alabama.

Louise L. Ashley

LE



**The Birmingham News**

EVENING AND SUNDAY

NEWS DEPARTMENT  
VINCENT TOWNSEND, MANAGING EDITOR

BIRMINGHAM 2, ALA.

March 4th, 1958

Dear Dr. Snyder:

I am sorry these are getting off to you so late, but Ed Strickland was supposed to have obtained the originals and mailed them to you several days ago. I am sorry these are so hard to read--but since time is so important I want to get these copies rushed to the airport.

I only hope that you will be able to get a report back to us by next Wednesday morning.

May I suggest that you mail the report to Park Street, care of me.

Best regards,

*Clancy Lake*  
Clancy Lake  
City Editor  
Birmingham News  
Birmingham, Ala.

March 7, 1958

REPORT ON MEDICAL EVIDENCE IN DEATH OF PHYLLIS ANN CARVER

I've been over the testimony of Mr. C. D. Brooks as it appeared in the transcript which I received yesterday and also I have studied the material received from Clancy Lake consisting of a copy of the protocol of an autopsy performed by Dr. L. C. Posey on April 12, 1949 on the body of Phyllis Carver. In addition I have also examined copies of several reports submitted by Mr. Brooks on various examinations of materials collected in connection with this same murder.

COMMENTS ON THE TESTIMONY OF MR. BROOKS  
AT THE TRIAL OF ELLIS FEWELL.

I studied the transcript before I received the materials sent by Mr. Lake. In general I was favorably impressed by his testimony. It seems to me that he is not only a keen observer but a trained observer and later when his testimony was compared to that in the autopsy protocol, except for one major exception his observations and statements parallel the notes of Dr. Posey to a remarkable degree.

With respect to the time of death as estimated from the condition of the stomach contents I believe that Mr. Brooks has estimated too long a time between the eating of the last food and the time of death. Relying on his statements as to the condition of the stomach contents my feeling is that death took place much closer to one hour after the last meal than the two or three hours which he estimated.

With reference to the wounds, the discrepancies between his testimony and Dr. Posey's protocol are minor and have no bearing on the main issues in this case.

For a person not trained as a physician Mr. Brooks' observations with respect to the autopsy, the significance of the bleeding, swelling of tissues etc. are all sound and have a distinct influence on my opinion with respect to the major discrepancy which will be discussed later.

COMMENTS ON THE AUTOPSY PROTOCOL.

Dr. Posey states that the autopsy was performed at 1:15 p.m. on April 12, 1949. He does not give a list of persons present, his assistant or witnesses. He states that rigor mortis is complete except for the neck. This is undoubtedly due to the rigor of the neck being broken in picking up and transporting the body from the place where it was found to the autopsy room.

He then lists in detail a series of many different wounds ranging from lacerations on the back of the scalp, shoulders and hand to severe and deep cuts on the throat, front of the chest,



armpit and other places. Any of several of the lacerations he described would have caused death in a very short time. Two separate knife thrusts completely transfix the heart while a deep laceration on the front of the neck severed the left carotid artery and the windpipe was severed in two different places. The injuries to the left lung could also have been fatal. Dr. Posey states "the deepest penetrating wound of the lung measured 45.5 cm. in depth." This is undoubtedly a typographical error as 45.5 cm. would be approximately 18 inches.

WAS A SEXUAL ATTACK COMMITTED ON THE  
BODY OF PHYLLIS CARVER?

The major discrepancy appearing in the transcript of Mr. Brooks testimony and the protocol of Dr. Posey involves this point. There seems to be no conflict about the fact that the body of Phyllis Carver was found fully clothed except for her shoes, her undergarments pulled up around her chest and her panties in place and showing no sign of having been disturbed. No blood, semen or other materials or tears of significance were observed.

Both Dr. Posey and Mr. Brooks report that the anus was dilated --- to the extent of approximately an inch as recorded in the protocol. Aside from a slight amount of fecal material around the anus there was no bruising, lacerations or blood or other foreign material and Dr. Posey reports that examination of a microscopical section of the anal canal revealed no evidence of injury as would be expected had coitus per anum been performed on a child of this size and age. Dr. Posey then further states that he examined a number of smears from the anal canal but found no evidence of spermatozoa.

On the other hand Mr. Brooks reported that he recovered some mucoid material from the rectum and prepared six slides for microscopical examination. Further he reports that he found numerous heads and tails of spermatozoa and at least three intact sperms. If Mr. Brooks is correct in his observations there can be no question but what coitus per anum was committed on this child.

Dr. Posey was undoubtedly a much more experienced microscopist than was Mr. Brooks. On the other hand searching for sperms under conditions such as this is a good deal like fishing in a lake. If you catch fish it proves fish were there --- if you don't it proves nothing.

Actually we know very little about the length of time the spermatozoa can be identified in a dead body. Up until comparatively recently it was generally believed that sperms disappeared in a very short time after death and particularly so in the rectum. During the last four or five years reliable evidence has been produced to demonstrate that under certain conditions at least, spermatozoa can be recovered from the vaginal tract days or even weeks after death. While they can be identified for a much shorter time in the rectum still it is longer than had been formerly believed.

It seems most unlikely and unusual that the girl's panties would have been carefully removed without tearing and without soiling and then carefully replaced after an act of this kind had been performed on her body. Against that is the solid

evidence that the anus was dilated to the extent of an inch in diameter (2 by 2.5 cm). It is true that occasionally there will be considerable dilatation of the anus after death due to normal muscle relaxation. But to find it dilated an inch in a nine year old child with the body still in rigor mortis convinces me that penetration had occurred. Likewise in view of the character of Mr. Brooks' testimony and the careful and methodical observations he reported I conclude that this child was violated per anum after death.

DOES THE MEDICAL EVIDENCE THROW ANY  
LIGHT ON THE GUILT OR INNOCENCE OF  
ELLIS FEWELL?

The answer to this question might seem argumentative but I believe some reliable deductions can be made from a study of the overall picture.

In the first place we are dealing with something more than just a murder. The person who killed this child must certainly have been in a state of most extraordinary mental turmoil. The multiplicity of the wounds --- cuttings, stabbings, direct violence and sexual assault all indicate a frenzy which was directed to something much more than simply destroying the life of a child. Of the cuttings and stabbings probably any of at least half a dozen would have been fatal in a very short time not to mention the numerous other lacerations, cuttings, blows on the face and head which undoubtedly would have produced unconsciousness if not death.

At the time of the murder of Phyllis Carver, Ellis Fewell was not yet 17 years old. In the course of nearly three decades that I have been actively investigating homicides I have observed a good many murders of this type. I've also investigated more than a few murders committed by teenage boys. I've never seen a murder of this kind committed by a teenager.

Several years ago I coined the term "juvenile compulsion murder" as a name for a certain type of murders frequently committed by teenage boys. These are characterized by the murder of another child or sometimes members of the youths own family without apparent motive and the only explanation the youth can give is that he just had a feeling he had to kill someone. Sometimes the victim was his best friend. In none of these do I recall any mutilation or sex angle connected with it. The murder of Phyllis Carver does not fit into this classification.

Had Ellis Fewell committed this murder, during the several years that followed before he was apprehended I am sure that during that period he would have shown unmistakable evidence of other similar assaults or at least serious mental aberration. The evidence left on the body of Phyllis Carver after her death is highly significant in that to me it indicates that the murderer was in a state of emotional frenzy and probably seriously mentally ill.

Respectfully submitted,

LeMoyne Snyder, M.D.



April 17, 1958

Mr. Clancy Lake  
The Birmingham News  
Birmingham 2, Alabama

Dear Mr. Lake:

Enclosed is a statement of some of my views  
about why innocent persons confess to serious crimes.  
Please feel free to edit this in any way you see  
fit.

Sincerely yours,

LeMoyne Snyder, M.D.

# The Birmingham News

EVENING AND SUNDAY

NEWS DEPARTMENT

VINCENT TOWNSEND, MANAGING EDITOR

BIRMINGHAM 2, ALA.

April 14, 1958

Dear Dr. Snyder:

As part of the continuing effort to free Stanford Ellis Fewell, we are currently writing a series of stories about his case. We hope to keep them going for several weeks because of the remendous response we have had.

Towards that end, I conferred today with the folks in New York and suggested that anything I could get from members of the Court of Last Resort would be of substantial aid. I was asked to write directly to some of the members in this regard, particularly where I had some definite subjects in mind.

Frankly, we have had a terrific response to a story we did yesterday on the fact that six different persons have confessed to the killing of the Carver girl.

Most of the callers want to know why in the world anyone--and particularly Stanford Ellis Fewell--would confess to a crime he did not commit.

In the case of Fewell, we all feel, of course, that it was done through intimidation. On the other hand, he made several non-inculpatory statements which did not involve him in the crime, but did involve someone else. He states that he made these statements only after he was told that his mother was in jail, and she would be released if he made a statement. I know this is what Fewell was told--but we have all been challenged on whether or not someone would be so attached to his mother that he would make a statement involving someone else (in this case, his brother) merely to get his mother out of jail.

If you have read his statement to Park Street and Ray Schindler, you know, of course, about this boy's close attachment to his mother.

What I need for the series is something about why people confess to crimes they did not commit. Anything you might write would be deeply appreciated, for we are trying to answer every question tossed at us.

It seems that I have written you only twice, and in each instance I have tried to impress the need for some sort of an immediate ~~immediate~~ answer. I hope my next letter will be different.

Many thanks for all your help so far, and I hope that one of our stories next week will be from you.

Regards, *Clancy Lake*  
Clancy Lake



## WHY DO INNOCENT PERSONS CONFESS TO COMMITTING SERIOUS CRIMES?

The question presented here is one which has become of particular interest and concern in recent years in large measure due to the "brainwashing" tactics perpetrated on prisoners of war.

In dealing with this question we first have to consider a considerable number of persons who receive a certain amount of satisfaction in being in the limelight and who voluntarily confess to serious crimes when they are in no way linked with the case as suspects and consequently no pressure of any type has been exerted. In a high proportion of murder cases which receive national publicity the investigation is seriously hampered by these voluntary confessions---all of which have to be checked out thereby wasting the time of officers whose services are sorely needed in other fields of the investigation. This has happened repeatedly in my own experience and in one famous case, the Black Dahlia murder in Los Angeles in 1945, I understand that more than 30 voluntary false confessions have been made to that crime.

We are more directly concerned with the reason why persons accused of crime and naturally subject to various emotional if not physical pressures confess when in fact they are innocent. Back in 1936 during the famous Purge Trials in Russia we were amazed and bewildered to see generals and high government officials go into court and eloquently proclaim their guilt of fictitious crimes and demand their own executions. That was before we knew anything about "brainwashing" and the exquisite pressures it is capable of producing.

It might be said that every innocent person has his own confession threshold. This threshold is dependent upon many factors such as his age, education, mental capacity, ability to understand and speak English fluently, knowledge of the law, available help from friends and attorneys.

Against this background of the individuals psychological armorment are stacked pressures of physical abuses, prolonged questioning, repeated and continuous accusations, threats of turning him over to the mercy of the mob and such other factors as for example statements that only by confessing can he escape execution.

Some innocent persons have the physical and mental stamina to withstand this treatment indefinitely without confessing. However a great many do not. One of the very common methods of torture is to lead the accused to believe that some person he loves and respects such as a member of his immediate family is being subjected to abuse which can only be alleviated by his confession.

I was once involved in a case remarkably similar to the murder for which Ellis Fewell was convicted. The body of a small child was found and the child had been the victim of a most atrocious mutilation-rape murder. The first suspect was a 16 year old boy of low mentality who lived only half a block away. He had recently escaped from an institution for juvenile delinquents in another state. When the police went to question him they found he had disappeared. His trail was picked up and it lead back to the state from which he had recently escaped. Two or three days after the murder he was picked up by the police and charged with the murder.

This youngster was taken into a room in the police station where he was confronted by 13 police officers all at the same time and accused of the crime. He readily confessed and signed a long dictated confession statement. As soon as he was arrested I left immediately for that state because I wanted to run some chemical tests for blood on the boys hand and clothing. I was certain that if he were guilty I would be able to find abundant evidence of blood on him even though he may have washed and bathed several times in the interim. The day after his confession I examined the boy and found no evidence of blood on his hands, under his fingernails or on his clothing and I expressed doubts as to his guilt. We took him to the state crime laboratory where he was given a polygraph test by a highly qualified expert. This examination showed no evidence of the boys guilt and fortunately before we left the laboratory a long distance call from the scene of the murder revealed that the real murderer had been apprehended and his bloody clothing and other convincing evidence plus also his confession left no question as to his guilt.

I then asked the lad why he had confessed to this horrible crime and was somewhat startled by his answer "because they told me to".

High class police organizations will have no part of third degree methods because they are smart enough to realize that false confessions do not solve crimes, are not too difficult to obtain and cause much trouble and expense later on. Adequate careful unbiased investigation of all possible evidence in the case is the only way to consistently develop conclusive proof of the real murderer.

. . . . .